#### A Handout

Prepared For:

#### The State Bar of Wisconsin

5302 Eastpark Boulevard Madison, Wisconsin, 53707

#### Domestic Litigation: Practical and Legal Implications April 8, 2011

Prepared By:

R.L. McNeely, Ph.D., J.D.

#### **Helen Bader School of Social Welfare**

University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53201-0786

-and-

#### **Midwest Legal Center**

Stonewood Corporate Center W175 N11163 Stonewood Dr., Ste. 220 Germantown, Wisconsin 53022-4700

R.L. McNeely is a professor of social welfare, at the University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, and a practicing personal injury attorney. He has published books, including (with Carl Pope) <u>Race, Crime and Criminal Justice</u> (Sage Publications, 1981), as well as more than eighty articles appearing in professional journals focusing upon work and family issues, aging issues, racial issues, and on numerous aspects of domestic violence. He is a Research Fellow of the Gerontological Society of America, he has testified before Congress on the issue of domestic violence, and he has served as a domestic violence consultant for the U.S. Army. Additionally, he is listed in three different volumes of *Who's Who* for academics, he has appeared on CBS Morning News, and his work in the field of domestic violence led to the 1988 NBC documentary "Of Macho and Men," hosted by Lucky Severson and Deborah Norville.



#### R.L. McNeely, Ph.D., J.D. State Bar of Wisconsin Madison, Wisconsin April 8, 2011

- 1. Males can be victimized by the smaller and weaker sex, and by a smaller and weaker sex it is said is less aggressive than men. Even males in their fighting primes, i.e., U.S. Army soldiers, can be, and are, victimized by the smaller and weaker sex. In fact, military women have been found to perpetrate more violence against military men than that perpetrated by military men against military women.<sup>1</sup>
- 2. Excluding wars and riots, the family is the predominant setting for every form of physical violence ranging from pushing and slapping to torture and murder. Estimates of the extent of husband-wife violence, occurring during the course of a marriage, range from 30 percent to 60 percent of all marriages, but if violence against children is included, it can be said that family violence is nearly universal. The annual cost of domestic violence to the U.S. economy, estimated conservatively, is more than \$8.3 billion. This cost includes medical care, mental health services, and lost work productivity for women.<sup>2</sup>
- 3. Men are the predominant but not exclusive perpetrators of the most extreme forms of domestic violence, including repeated serious violence and domestic homicide. However, women are more likely than men to perpetrate acts of domestic violence, some studies have shown that women are more likely than men to inflict serious injuries via use of weapons, females perpetrate somewhat more than one-third of all domestic violence homicides, these homicides are not simply reactions to male aggression,<sup>3</sup>



R.L. McNeely and Coramae Mann, "Domestic Violence is a Human Issue," <u>Journal of Interpersonal Violence</u>, (March) 1990: 129-132; Peter H. Neidig, "Executive Summary Family Advocacy Prevention/Survey Project Update: Overview and Preliminary Findings," Behavioral Science Associates (unpublished paper for U.S. Army), Stony Brook, N.Y: 1993; R. Heyman and Peter H. Neidig, "A Comparison of Spousal Aggression Prevalence Rates in the U.S. Army and Civilian Representation Samples," <u>Journal of Clinical and Consulting Psychology</u>, V. 67 (2) April, 1999: 239-242; Philip W. Cook, Abused Men: The Hidden Side of Domestic Violence, Westport, Conn: Praeger Publishers, 1997.

M. Straus and George Hotaling (eds.), <u>The Social Causes of Husband-Wife Violence</u>, Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press: 1980; Cf: Patricia Tjaden and Nancy Thoennes, <u>Extent, Nature, and Consequences of Partner Violence</u>: Findings from the National Violence Against Women Survey (Monograph), National Institute of Justice, 2000 (July): 57 pp., See, esp., Pp. 9–14; W. Max, D.P. Rice; E. Finklestein, R.A. Bardwell, and S. Leadbetter, "The Economic Toll of Intimate Partner Violence Against Women in the United States," Violence and Victims, V. 19 (3) 2004: 259-272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> R.J. Gelles, <u>The Violent Home: A Study of Physical Aggression Between Husbands and Wives.</u> Beverly Hill, CA: Sage Publications, 1974; Murray Straus and Richard Gelles, "Societal Change and Change in Family Violence from 1975 to 1985 as Revealed in Two National Surveys," <u>Journal of</u>

Marriage and the Family, V. 48, 1986: 465-479; John Hamel and Tonia Nicholls (Eds.), <u>Family Interventions in Domestic Violence: A Handbook of Gender-Inclusive Theory and Treatment</u>, N.Y: Springer Publishing, 2006; Maureen McLeod, "Women Against Men: An Examination of Domestic Violence Based on an Analysis of Official Data and National Victimization Data," <u>Justice Quarterly</u>, V. 1, 1984: 171-193; Coramae Richey Mann, <u>When Women Kill</u>, Albany, N.Y: Suny Press, 1996; Jon Aerts, "Male Victims Get Lost in Domestic-Abuse Data," <u>The Seattle Times</u>, December 25, 2010.

women are about twice as likely to assault an elderly spouse, and mothers have been found to commit child abuse about 62 percent more often than fathers, often brutally killing children by use of hands and feet. Too, it has been found that about 5 percent of all abusing families involve both husbands and wives who are victimized as often as once every two months, but men are about twice as likely as women to perpetrate the most frequent victimizations and, whereas men, in the aggregate, beat up women about 1.7 times per year, women beat up men about 1.4 times per year (median rates). Simply put, both men and women are deeply implicated in domestic violence.<sup>4</sup>

- 4. Interestingly, some anecdotal evidence as well as some empirical research shows that there are no statistically significant differences in the numbers of male versus female domestic assault victims seeking treatment in hospital emergency rooms.<sup>5</sup>
- 5. Women are no less inclined to use violence in domestic relations than are men, and women have the same intentions as do men when using violence. These intentions are to get the attention of the other spouse, to inflict physical injury, and/or to control the behavior of the other spouse.<sup>6</sup>



M. Carrado, Malcolm J. George, E. Loxam, L. Jones and D. Templar, "Aggression in British Heterosexual Relationships: A Descriptive Analysis," Aggressive Behavior, V. 22, 1996: 401-415; R.J.H. Russell and B. Hulson, "Physical and Psychological Abuse of Heterosexual Partners," Personality and Individual Differences, V. 34, 1992; 457-473; R. Sommer, Male and Female Perpetrated Partner Abuse, Doctoral Dissertation, University of Manitoba, University Microfilms International, ISBN-0-315-99064-3, 1994; J. Archer and N. Ray, "Dating Violence in the United Kingdom: A Preliminary Study, Aggressive Behavior, Vol. 15, 1989: 337-345; Beth Ensminger-Vanfossen, "Intersexual Violence in Monroe County, New York," Victimology, V. 4 (2) 1979: 299-305; Suzanne Steinmetz, The Cycle of Violence: Assertive, Aggressive and Abusive Family Interaction, New York, N.Y.: Praeger, 1977; Leslie Mitchel, Child Abuse and Neglect Fatalities: A Review of the Problem and Strategies for Reform, Working Paper 838. Monograph of the National Center on Child Abuse Prevention Research, National Committee for the Prevention of Child Abuse, Chicago, Illinois, 1987; Murray Straus and Richard Gelles, "Societal Change and Change in Family Violence from 1975 to 1985 as Revealed in Two National Surveys," Journal of Marriage and the Family, V. 48, 1986: 465-479; Coramae Richey Mann, "Maternal Filicide of Pre-Schoolers," Pp: 227-246 in A.F. Kuhl (Ed.), The Dynamics of the Victim-Offender Interaction," Cincinnati, OH: Anderson, 1990; Sally L. Satel, "It's Always His Fault," The Women's Quarterly, V. 12 (Summer): 1997: 4-10; For some actual elder abuse case accounts, Cf: R.L. McNeely and Philip Cook, "Notes on Newspaper Accounts of Male Elder Abuse," In J.I. Kosberg (Ed.). Journal of Elder Abuse and Neglect., V. 19 (1&2) 2007: 99-108.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Letter to the Editor, <u>Time Magazine</u>, January 11, 1988, p. 12; S.V. McLeer and R. Anwar, "A Study of Battered Women Presenting in an Emergency Department," <u>American Journal of Public Health</u>, V. 79 (January) 1989: 65-66; W. Goldberg and M. Tomlanovich, "Domestic Violence Victims in the Emergency Department," <u>Journal of the American Medical Association</u>, V. 251 (June 22-29), 1984: 3259-3264.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> G. Stuart, T. Moore, K. Gordon, J. Hellmuth, S. Ramsey and C. Kahler, "Reasons for Intimate Partner Violence Perpetration Among Arrested Women," <u>Violence Against Women</u>, V. 12, 2006: 609-621; M. Carrado, Malcolm J. George, E. Loxam, L. Jones and D. Templar, "Aggression in British Heterosexual Relationships: A

Additionally, men also are more likely than women to be the victims of violence, not just in spousal or intimate partner relationships, but in dating relationships, as well, <sup>7</sup> and women do not resort to violence merely as a mechanism of self-defense.<sup>8</sup>

6. But there is another side to the spectrum of studies reporting females to be more likely than males to perpetrate domestic violence. Some studies report the contrary finding, that women are more

Descriptive Analysis," <u>Aggressive Behavior</u>, V. 22, 1996: 401-415; Suzanne Steinmetz, "The Battered Husband Syndrome, "<u>Victimology</u>, V. 2, 1980: 499-509; Suzanne K. Steinmetz, "Women and Violence: Victims and Perpetrators," <u>American Journal of Psychotherapy</u>, V. 34, 1980: 334-350. Suzanne K. Steinmetz, <u>The Cycle of Violence: Assertive, Aggressive, and Abusive Family Interaction</u>, New York, N.Y: Praeger: 1977; Jon Aerts, "Male Victims Get Lost in Domestic-Abuse Data," <u>The Seattle Times</u>, December 25, 2010.

<sup>7</sup> Murray Straus, "Dominance and Symmetry in Partner Violence by Male and Female University Students in 32 Nations," Children and Youth Services Review, V. 30, 2008; 252-275 (Convenience sample of 13,601 students enrolled in 68 schools); T. Moffitt and A. Caspi, Findings About Partner Violence From the Dunedin Multidisciplinary Health and Development Study (Monograph), National Institute of Justice, NCJ 170018 (July) 1999; Miriam Ehrensaft, Terrie Moffit and Avshalom Caspi, "Clinically Abusive Relationships in an Unselected Birth Cohort: Men's and Women's Participation and Developmental Antecedents," Journal of Abnormal Psychology, V. 13 (May) 2004: 258-270; Murray Straus, "Physical Assaults by Wives: A Major Social Problem," Pp: 67-87 in R. Gelles and D. Loseky (Eds.), Current Controversies on Family Violence, Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, 1993; D. Dutton, M. Kwong, and K. Bartholomew, "Gender Differences in Patterns of Relationship Violence in Alberta," Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science, V. 31, 1999: 150-160; B. Morse, "Beyond the Conflict Tactics Scale: Assessing Gender Differences in Partner Violence," Violence and Victims, V. 10 (4) 1995: 251-269; A. Demaris, "Male Versus Female Initiation of Aggression: The Case of Courtship Violence," Pp. 111-120 in E. Viano (Ed.), Intimate Violence: Interdisciplinary Perspectives, Wash., D.C: Taylor & Francis, 1992; Jennifer Langhinrichsen-Rohling, Peter Neidig, and G. Thorn, "Violent Marriages: Gender Differences in Levels of Current Violence and Past Abuse," Journal of Family Violence, V. 10 (2), 1995: 159-175 (In cases involving police domestic calls, a survey of 200 military couples reported an 83 percent rate of mutual assaults).

M. Straus, "Physical Assaults by Women Partners: A Major Social Problem," Pp: 210-221 in M.R. Walsh (Ed.), Women, Men, and Gender: Ongoing Debates, New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997. (Here Straus examined only female self-reported rates of female-to-male violence in response to criticism that the Conflict-Tactics Scale fails to assess if female violence is only in response to male aggression. He found no differences in these reports and the rates generated by the CTS); Coramae Richey Mann, "Getting Even," Justice Quarterly, V. 5, 1988: 33-51 (Sixty percent of female homicide perpetrators claimed self-defense but this study found that 58 percent of the murders had been premeditated, 30 percent of the women had killed their intimates when those intimates were bound, drunk, or asleep); Poco Kernsmith, "Exerting Power or Striking Back: A Gendered Comparison of Motivations for Domestic Violence Perpetration," Violence and Victims, V. 20 (2) 2005:173-185 (Females reported using violence in response to prior abuse, citing revenge and retaliation as a primary motivation. Too, women were more motivated than men by the desire to maintain personal liberties in a relationship where they had been victimized); M. Carrado, Malcolm. J. George, E. Loxam, L. Jones and D. Templar, "Aggression in British Heterosexual Relationships: A Descriptive Analysis," Aggressive Behavior, V. 22, 1996: 401-415 (Both sexes are similar in their reasons for committing violence. These reasons are: (1) To get a partner to do something a perpetrator wanted; (2) as a response to something said or threatened; (3) to stop a partner from doing something; or (4) as the means by which a perpetrator "got through" to a partner, meaning got the partner's attention.)

victimized than men. The National Violence Against Women Survey, for example, found that 64% of the victims of partner violence are women, and 36% are men. But the study also asked this question: "Has a man or boy ever made you have sex by using force, or threatening to harm you, or someone close to you? Just so there is no mistake, by sex we mean putting his penis in your vagina." But that question does not differentiate between stranger and non-stranger rape. No one was asked if someone intentionally launched a kick specifically to the groin area. Because of this, some researchers say the study unfairly minimized men's victimization. But, we don't need to go there. Let's say we accept the 64% and 36% figures. That still means that there is a lot of victimization going on.

- 7. One's employment has a lot to do with things. Spouses with limited financial and other resources, or low status occupational positions, or low job satisfaction, are more likely to resort to violence in marital quarrels. A key factor explaining abuse against children is long-term unemployment in the year preceding the abuse.<sup>10</sup>
- 8. Marital stability, versus volatility, domestic violence, and instability, is often associated with low-happiness/low affection marriages. Too, marital disputes in nuclear families must be settled by the antagonists, themselves, versus having the tension-reducing mechanism of a majority vote, and features of nuclear families that are intimacy provoking also can be violence provoking, such as having extensive knowledge of the other spouse's biography.<sup>11</sup>
- 9. Mandatory arrest policies are based on research showing that mandatory arrest is the most effective deterrent to future violence by perpetrators. But, subsequent research has shown that (a)



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Patricia Tjaden and Nancy Thoennes, <u>Extent</u>, <u>Nature</u>, and <u>Consequences of Partner Violence</u>: <u>Findings from the National Violence Against Women Survey</u> (Monograph), National Institute of Justice, 2000 (July): 57 pp. (Nationally representative sample with 8,000 men and 8,000 women.)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Cf: Christina M. Gibson-Davis, et al., "Employment and the Risk of Domestic Abuse Among Low-Income Women," <u>Journal of Marriage and the Family</u>, 67 (5) December 2005:1149-1168. Greer L. Fox, et al., "Economic Distress and Intimate Violence: Testing Family Stress and Resources Theories," <u>Journal of Marriage and the Family</u>, Vol. 64 (August) 2002: 793-807. J. O'Brien, "Violence in Divorce-Prone Families," <u>Journal of Marriage and the Family</u>, V. 33, 1971; W.G. Dyer, "Family Reactions to the Father's Job," in <u>Blue Collar World: Studies of the American Worker</u>, Shostak and Gomberg (Eds.), Englewood Cliffs: N.J. Prentice-Hall, 1964; Leslie Mitchel, <u>Child Abuse and Neglect Fatalities: A Review of the Problem and Strategies for Reform</u>, Working Paper 838. Monograph of the National Center on Child Abuse Prevention Research, National Committee for the Prevention of Child Abuse, Chicago, Illinois, 1987.

Sharon K. Houseknecht and Anne S. Macke, "Combining Marriage and Career: The Marital Adjustment of Professional Women," <u>Journal of Marriage and the Family</u>, Vol. 43 (August) 1981:651-661; M. Straus and George Hotaling (eds.), <u>The Social Causes of Husband-Wife Violence</u>, Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press: 1980; R.L. McNeely, "Review and Synthesis of Research on Batterers and Interventions," a paper presented at the U.S. Army's <u>Developing an Inclusive Vision in Domestic Violence: Advanced Spouse Abuse (International) Training Course</u> (for Army clinicians), April, 2006, San Antonio, TX: 23 pp.

those arrested, within one year, perpetrate more violence than was perpetrated prior to arrest, (b) states with mandatory arrest laws have homicide rates about 50 percent higher than states without mandatory arrest laws, (c) arrest does not exert a significant deterrent effect on domestic violence, and (d) mandatory arrest doubles the frequency of violence among unemployed men, especially if they are not married to their victims.<sup>12</sup>

- 10. Black males have been found to be no more likely than White males to engage in domestic violence when social class is controlled or, at the least, differences between Whites and Blacks are greatly diminished when social class is taken into account and, as found by Lockhart, middle-class Black females experience comparatively less domestic violence than their middle-class White counterparts, although the difference is slight (slightly lower median rates of victimizations). 13
- 11. Many lower- and middle-class African American clients may adhere to verbal and non-verbal communication cues that are contrary to what Whites might expect.<sup>14</sup> For example, instead of



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Lawrence W. Sherman and Richard A. Berk, "The Specific Deterrent Effect of Arrest for Domestic Assault," American Sociological Review, V. 49, 1984: 261-272; Cf: Lawrence W. Sherman and Richard A. Berk, The Minneapolis Domestic Violence Experiment, A Police Foundation Reports Monograph, Wash., D.C., April, 1984; Janell D. Schmidt and Lawrence W. Sherman, "Does Arrest Deter Domestic Violence?," American Behavioral Scientist, V. 36 (May) 1993: 601-609; Radha Iyengar, "The Protection Battered Spouses Don't Need," Op Ed piece appearing in The New York Times, August 7, 2007; J. David Hirschel and D.J. Dawson, Violence Against Women: Synthesis of Research for Law Enforcement Officials, A Monograph of the U.S. Dept. of Justice, September, 2003: 34 pp.; Christopher Maxwell, Joel Garner, and Jeffrey Fagan, The Effects of Arrest on Intimate Partner Violence: New Evidence from the Spouse Assault Replication Program, A Monograph of the National Institute of Justice, July 2001, (Key findings included (1) There is only a modest reduction in repeat offending associated with arrest compared to the reductions in repeat offending associated with the perpetrator's age and past criminal record; (2) More than half of all perpetrators did not re-offend during the follow-up period regardless of whether they were arrested; and (3) a minority of perpetrators re-offend regardless of whether they were arrested, counseled, or separated from the victim; Lawrence W. Sherman and Douglas Smith, "Crime, Punishment and Stake in Conformity: Informal Control of Domestic Violence," American Sociological Review, V. 57 (5) (October) 1992: 680-690.

Lettie Lockhart, "Spousal Violence: A Cross-Racial Perspective," Pp: 85-101 in R.L. Hampton (Ed.), <u>Black Family Violence</u>: Current Research and Theory, Lexington, MA: Lexington Books, 1991; Lettie Lockhart, "Methodological Issues in Comparative Racial Analyses: The Case of Wife Abuse," <u>Social Work Research and Abstracts</u>, V. 21, 1985: 35-41; Patricia Tjaden and Nancy Thoennes, <u>Extent, Nature, and Consequences of Partner Violence</u>: Findings from the National Violence Against Women Survey (Monograph), National Institute of Justice, 2000 (July): 57 pp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> R.L. McNeely and M.K. Badami, "Interracial Communication in School Social Work," <u>Social Work</u>, V. 29, No. 1 (January-February) 1984: 22-26; Cf: Thomas Kochman, "Cross-Cultural Communication: Contrasting Perspectives, Conflicting Sensibilities," <u>The Florida FL Reporter</u>, (Spring/Fall) 1971 at 3-16, 53-54; Thomas Kochman, "Orality and Literacy as Factors of 'Black' and 'White' Communicative Behavior," <u>Linguistics</u>, 136 (Sept.) 1974: 91-115; Thomas Kochman, "Blacks and Whites: Differing Perceptions," <u>USA Today</u>, May 4, 1992, at 13A.

unintentionally conveying deceit, boredom, or not being mentally alert, such clients, especially when in the listening role, may intentionally fail to make direct, non-wavering, eye contact, as the means by which they show respect and deference. In fact, only European Americans, not Asian Americans, nor Latino Americans, nor Native Americans, typically adhere to the rule of non-wavering direct eye contact. Especially among many lower-class African Americans, a direct non-wavering eye contact gaze is likely to be regarded as an intentional effort by the direct gazer to be menacing and intimidating. Adherence to the "look-them-in-the-eye" rule varies with exposure to European Americans.

- 12. Some Blacks and Whites regard domestic violence differently. Whites are more likely than Blacks to view women as being docile, weak, and at the mercy of stronger and more aggressive males. Blacks, on the other hand, are more likely to respect the fighting prowess of Black women because, whereas many White women receive "slap the cad" instructions as tactics to ward off unruly males, many Black women, by contrast, are taught how to use scalding water, scalding grits and, in the past, lye, as tactical methods either of attack, or defense from attack. Additionally, Black women are likely to ascribe to themselves a portion of responsibility for their own victimization, often feeling that they either should have been more wary, more vigilant, or more prepared to respond to aggression via independent, self-reliant, and tough fighting tactics.<sup>15</sup>
- 13. Adult alcoholism, drug abuse, depression, suicide attempts, and severe obesity all have been found related to having witnessed violence against one's mother. But associations between adverse childhood experiences have also been found for adult heart disease, cancer, chronic lung disease, and liver disease. Adult males who witnessed domestic violence as children not only are more depressed than other males, with those who both witnessed domestic violence and who, themselves, were abused, being not only the most likely to be depressed in adulthood, but also the most likely to suffer psychopathological problems, including antisocial and borderline personalities. Children who witness domestic violence are more likely than other children to have both poor verbal abilities and adversely affected intellectual functioning, and a just-released Canadian study just replicated findings showing an association between having suffered physical abuse as a child and experiencing heart disease during adulthood. Too, recent research has



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> R.L. McNeely and José Torres, "Reflections on Racial Differences in Perceptions of Intimate Partner Violence," <u>Social Justice in Context</u>, Vol. 4 (1) 2009: 129-136.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> "BPD" or borderline personality is a serious mental illness involving pervasive instability in interpersonal relationships, moods, behavior and self-image. Family and worklife are often disrupted as is long-term planning. BPD accounts for about twenty percent of psychiatric hospitalizations, with about two percent of the U.S. population so affected. More individuals are afflicted with BPD than those afflicted with either bi-polar disorder or schizophrenia. It is also characterized by high rates of suicidal behavior, as well as high rates of self-injury without suicidal intent.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Amy Murrell, Karen Christoff and Kris Henning, "Characteristics of Domestic Violence Offenders: Associations with Childhood Exposure to Violence," <u>Journal of Family Violence</u>, V. 22 (7): 2007: 523-532; Alissa Huth-Bocks, Alytia Levendosky and Michael Semel, "The Direct and Indirect Effects of Domestic Violence on Young Children's Intellectual Functioning," <u>Journal of Family Violence</u>, V. 16 (3) 2001: 269-290;

found that children whose parents divorced are more than twice as likely during adulthood as are other adults to suffer a stroke. Divorce also has a particularly frightening depression-related effect on boys: Even when factors such as socioeconomic status, past history of mood disorders, and other factors were controlled, they have been found to be more than twice as likely as other males to have considered suicide in adulthood.<sup>18</sup>

14. The most rigorous examinations of batterer intervention programs have found no differences between treated batterers, and their control group counterparts, in terms of their attitudes toward domestic violence. Both those exposed to treatment, and those not exposed to treatment, continued to feel that battering could be justified. However, males who completed longer treatment programs (26 weeks), versus shorter treatment programs (8 weeks), had significantly fewer re-offense complaints lodged against them. But, unfortunately, methodological problems with the studies suggest the possibility that these men were more highly motivated to avoid reoffending, regardless of treatment (attrition was an issue with all of the studies -- these men did not drop out of the longer treatment). Other findings include: (a) men arrested following a domestic violence complaint are somewhat less likely to re-offend than those not arrested, but arrests do not deter chronically-aggressive batterers; (b) prosecuting violators of restraining orders has been found associated with increases in the homicides of white married and unmarried females, and for African American unmarried intimates; (c) there are virtually no data demonstrating that federallyfunded approaches to resolving domestic violence are effective, according to the assessments of Yale-affiliated psychiatrist, Sally Satel; and (d) some reconsideration and reframing of mandatory arrest policies, perhaps, is warranted. <sup>19</sup>

Esme Fuller-Thomson, S. Brennenstuhl, and J. Frank, "The Association Between Childhood Physical Abuse and Heart Disease in Adulthood: Findings From A Representative Community Sample," <u>Child Abuse and Neglect</u>, V. 34, 2010: 689-698; Vincent J. Felitti, et al., "Relationship of Childhood Abuse and Household Dysfunction to Many of Leading Causes of Death in Adults: The Adverse Childhood Experiences (ACE) Study," <u>American Journal of Preventive Medicine</u>, V. 14, No. 4, (May) 1998: 245-258; Esme Fuller-Thomson, Angela Dalton and Rukshan Mehta, "Is There a Link Between Parental Divorce During Childhood and Stroke in Adulthood?: Findings From a Population Based Survey," A paper presented at the 62<sup>nd</sup> Annual Meeting of the <u>Gerontological Society of America</u>, New Orleans, LA, Nov. 19-23, 2010

- Esme Fuller-Thomson and Angela Dalton, "Suicidal Ideation Among Individuals Whose Parents Have Divorced: Findings from a Representative Canadian Community Survey, <u>Psychiatry Research</u> (2011), doi: 10.1016/j.psychres.2010.12.0041; Cf: "The Frightening Effect of Divorce on Boys," BCNN1.Com, Jan. 24, 2011. Researchers note that the boys are likely more affected than girls due to the probable loss of the male role model, the father figure.
- Lynette Felder and David R. Forde, "The Broward Experiment," Pp: 5-13 in <u>National Institute of Justice Special Report</u>, U.S. Department of Justice, June, 2003. Methodology and indicators: Randomly selected treatment group sentenced to one year probation and 26 weeks of group counseling, control group sentenced to probation, only; Batterers interviewed at adjudication and again 6 mos. later; Victims interviewed at adjudication and at 6 and 12 mos. later; Defendants tracked in terms of court records for one year. Robert C. Davis, Christopher D. Maxwell, and Bruce G. Taylor, "The Brooklyn Experiment," Pp: 15-21 in <u>National Institute of Justice Special Report</u>, U.S. Department



- 15. One study involving police responses to domestic violence produced interesting results, as follows: (a) Neither protective orders nor follow-up counseling by specially trained police officers produced any improvement over arresting offenders; (b) issuing citations notifying offenders to appear at a future court date caused more violence than did arresting them; (c) offenders who left the scene before police arrived and who were issued warrants had less repeat violence than offenders who left the scene but were not issued warrants, and (d) arrest affords more protection from re-victimization for Whites and Hispanics than it does for Blacks, perhaps because proportionately more Blacks are unemployed and/or unmarried. As noted by the authors, there are "Both deterrent and backfiring effects of arrest...the movement to arrest batterers may be doing more harm than good...Arrest may assist victims, short term, but facilitates violence in the long term...Arrest cured some but made others worse...Mandatory arrest laws should be repealed." <sup>20</sup>
- 16. In 1986, the best evidence indicated that somewhere in the area of about 1.8 million women were being victimized by severe violence during a given year, whereas around 2.1 million men also were the victims of severe violence, in the U.S., during the same period (years of 1975 1985). But whereas male-to-female violence appeared to have decreased after 1975, it also appeared that female-to-male violence was increasing. Donna LeClerc, who is the executive director of a shelter in Sarasota, FL (DASH--Domestic Abuse Safe House), speaking more recently, in 2006, has noted that: "Men have gotten the point that it's not OK to (commit abuse) but, somehow, it's turned around, and it's OK for women to do those things." LET'S HOPE THIS IS NOT TRUE, BUT:
- 17. Based on a nationally representative sample, it was reported in 1986 that whereas men perpetrate

of Justice, June, 2003. Methodology and indicators: Randomly selected batterers sentenced either to 39 hours (26 weeks) of Duluth batterer treatment or 39 hrs (over 8 weeks), or 39 hrs of community service; Batterers and victims interviewed at sentencing, 6 mos. and 12 months, about new violence; Official complaint and arrest data gathered at 6 and 12 months after sentencing; Christopher Maxwell, Joel Garner, and Jeffrey Fagin, The Effects of Arrest on Intimate Partner Violence: New Evidence from the Spouse Assault Replication Program, National Institute of Justice Research Brief, (July) 2001; Laura Dugin, Daniel Nagin, and Richard Rosenfeld, Exposure Reduction or Backlash: The Effect of Domestic Violence Resources on Intimate Partner Homicide, National Institute of Justice, 2001; Sally L. Satel, "It's Always His Fault," The Women's Quarterly, Summer (12) 1997: 4-10. See: sallysatelmd.com

- Janell D. Schmidt and Lawrence W. Sherman, "Does Arrest Deter Domestic Violence," <u>American</u> Behavioral Scientist, V. 36, No. 5 (May) 1993: 601-609. (Researchers found that arrest increases recidivism in Milwaukee.)
- Ted Rowlands, "The Other Face of Domestic Violence," <u>CNN.com</u>, April 6, 2006; Murray Straus and Richard Gelles, "Societal Change and Change in Family Violence from 1975 to 1985 as Revealed in Two National Surveys," <u>Journal of Marriage and the Family</u>, V. 48, 1986: 465-479. Whereas domestic violence by males against women decreased by about 27% between 1975 and 1985, violence by women against men increased by about four percent during the same period. Expressed in terms of numbers, what this means is that 423,000 more women would have been victimized in 1985 had abuse rates remained the same as they were in 1975, while about 27,000 more men, in fact, were abused than were abused in 1975.



an average of 2.5 acts of violence per year, women perpetrate an average of 3 acts of violence a year. When it came to the perpetration of severe violence, men committed an average of 2.4 acts per year, but women committed, on average, 3.0 acts of severe violence per year, but among that small group of individuals who were the most frequent perpetrators of violence, men were about twice as likely as women to be the perpetrators. Ten years later, in 1996, a British study reported that about one-third of assaulted British women experienced three or more types of assaults by intimates, while only about twenty-five percent of assaulted men experienced three or more types of assaults. This means that for that group of people victimized most frequently, men are more often the perpetrators of violence. But men, in the aggregate, suffered higher overall victimizations, and they were found to suffer a higher incidence rate of severe victimizations, meaning that women perpetrated more acts of both overall violence, and more acts of severe violence, than did men. Whereas men were more likely to push or grab intimates, women were more likely to slap, punch, kick, throw objects, and to strike their intimates with sharp objects. 22

- 18. I might add that these findings do not merely reflect violence in the United States and Britain. Studies performed in other countries have reported similar findings. For example, in Canada, one study reported that 10 percent of the men, but 13 percent of the women, actually had perpetrated acts of severe violence. In Britain, equal numbers (4.2 percent) of both sexes have reported being seriously assaulted. <sup>23</sup>
- 19. Women, it has been found, not only do not engage in domestic violence exclusively in self-defense, they do not kill men simply in self-defense. Although spousal violence, for example, was not present in the personal histories of many women (participating in a six-city study) who had killed their husbands, nearly 40% of the murderesses were found to have past arrest records for committing violent crimes, indicating, perhaps, that many women who kill husbands simply are violent people. Also, whereas it was found that nearly 40 percent of women who killed their husbands claimed self-defense, only 3.1% of these homicides were assessed as being justifiable acts of self defense. And 56.3 percent employed pre-meditation in spousal killings, while about 80 percent of the murderesses were found to have prior arrest records.



Murray Straus and Richard Gelles, "Societal Change and Change in Family Violence from 1975 to 1985 as Revealed in Two National Surveys," <u>Journal of Marriage and the Family</u>, V. 48, 1986: 465-479; M. Carrado, Malcolm. J. George, E. Loxam, L. Jones and D. Templar, "Aggression in British Heterosexual Relationships: A Descriptive Analysis," <u>Aggressive Behavior</u>, V. 22, 1996: 401-415

Merle Brinkerhoff and Eugen Lupri, "Interspousal Violence," <u>Canadian Journal of Sociology</u>, V. 13, 1988: 407-424 (562 couples); Eugen Lupri, "Harmonie und Aggression: Uber die Dialektick Ehlicher Gewalt," <u>Kolner Zeitschrift fur Soziologie und Sozialphycholgie</u>, V. 42, 1990: 479-501; Catriona Mirrlees-Black and Carole Byron, <u>Domestic violence: Findings From a New British Crime Survey Self-Completion Questionnaire</u>, Home Office Research Study, 191, London: HMSO, 1999 (126 pp.).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Coramae Mann, When Women Kill, Albany, N.Y: SUNY (State Univ. of New York) Press, 1996. (Six-city

- 20. Another question has to do with the extent to which verbal and symbolic aggression directed against partners is gender related. In a national study, with 6002 respondents, examining such things as insulting, swearing at, sulking, refusing to talk, stomping out of the room or yard, saying things to spite a partner, threatening to throw something at a partner, and actually throwing, hitting, kicking, or smashing something, no significant differences were found between the sexes. Seventy-four percent of the men and 75 percent of the women engaged in verbal/symbolic aggression.<sup>25</sup>
- 21. Finally, Ann Frodi, Pauline Ropert, and Jacqueline Macauley, thirty years ago, in 1977, surveyed the empirical literature and found that in 61 percent of all studies reviewed, men were <u>not</u> found to be more aggressive than women. But Frodi and her colleagues were not just examining studies of domestic violence. They were looking at studies of aggressive behavior, across the board. In other words, even when they included studies of <u>non-domestic</u> violence, a sphere in which women are considered to be even more timid than they are in family, cohabitation, or dating relationships, women, they found, in the majority of all studies reviewed, were no less likely than men to be violent. Thirty years later, and nearly 200 studies later, men and women register approximately equal rates of violence in domestic relations. <sup>26</sup>

study)

Murray Straus and Stephen Sweet, "Verbal/Symbolic Aggression in Couples: Incidence Rates and Relationships to Personal Characteristics," <u>Journal of Marriage and the Family</u>, V. 54, 1992: 346-357.

A. Frodi, Pauline Ropert-Thome and Jacqueline Macauley, "Are Women Always Less Aggressive Than Men?" <u>Psychological Bulletin</u>, V. 84 (4) 1977: 634-660. (Reviewed 314 experimental studies appearing between 1967 & 1974.); M.A. Straus, "The Controversy Over Domestic Violence by Women: A Methodological, Theoretical, and Sociology of Science Analysis," Pp: 17-44 in X.B. Arriaga and S. Oskamp (Eds.), <u>Violence in Intimate Relationships</u>, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 1999; Cf: Martin S. Fiebert, <u>References Examining Assaults by Women on Their Spouses or Male Partners: An Annotated Bibliography</u> (Monograph reviewing 175 investigations), California State University-Long Beach, Dept. of Psychology, 2005. (A prior version of this monograph was published in <u>Sexuality and Culture</u>, V. 8, 2004: 140-177; R.L. McNeely and Gloria Simpson-Robinson, "The Truth About Domestic Violence: A Falsely Framed Issue," <u>Social Work</u>, Vol. 32, No. 6 (November-December), 1987: 485-490.